A STUDY TO INVESTIGATE SOCIAL CONTROL THEORIES AND THE ROLE OF CCTV AS A SOCIAL CONTROL AGENT

By Nicholas Reeve

ABSTRACT

The Primary aim of this dissertation is investigate social control theories, and how they compare to the actual role of CCTV as a social control agent.

Through a reflective analysis of the six years spent as a CCTV operator, the author hopes to use this experience in conjunction with statistical data gathered from both the London Borough of Harrow’s CCTV control room, and the Metropolitan Police to investigate the current role of CCTV.

This study investigated the reality of procedure within CCTV, and how its role as a risk management strategy transforms it into an electronic Panopticon, capable of influencing the behaviour of those subjected to surveillance.

Nicholas Reeve submitted this dissertation as part fulfillment of the degree of BA (Hons) Criminology at Nottingham Trent University
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank the teaching staff of Nottingham Trent University’s Criminology department, particularly Dr Michael Sutton for his continual support and guidance. I would also like to thank my former colleagues at Harrow Civic Centre’s CCTV department for their friendship and guidance throughout the past six years, as well as Harrow’s crime reduction team for their help during this dissertation.

A special thanks to my parents for their continued support and for making this possible.
(1a) Purpose and aim of Dissertation

At a broad level, this dissertation aims to analyse theories and practices concerned with social control, and how they compare with CCTV (Closed Circuit Television) as a social control agent.

Such a large topic touches on a range of diverse issues, many of which cannot be fully explored in one single piece of research. Focus is therefore considered necessary in researching the topic, and the context of a pre-determined social theories assist in ensuring this.

The research subject is the London Borough of Harrow’s CCTV system. Through an analysis of its procedural mechanisms and how they are implemented by its operators, it is hoped that tangible theories can be constructed which offer more specific insight into state surveillance, and what repercussions this may have upon members of the public and the future of social control.

One key objective of this dissertation is to test and develop independent learning ability, whilst improving a range of relevant skills such as time-management and written presentation skills. The author aims to improve skills relevant to critical reflection through the provisional and revisable nature of the dissertation process. Despite such revisions, the author aims to structure a cohesive and sustained discussion throughout the dissertation, which will be related to relevant academic themes as deemed appropriate.

(1b) Background and justification of research topic

The London Borough of Harrow spends approximately £500,000 a year maintaining one hundred and fifty six cameras. With thirty two Boroughs in London, the number of cameras is predicted to be in 10,524 (BBC: 2002). These thirty two systems represent only a handful of the five hundred and eighty five systems throughout Britain, a notable increase on the three present in 1990. Since then, the government has investment £208 million pounds, which represents three quarters of the money spent on crime prevention.

Unlike other social control agencies permitted to perform surveillance, such as the Police, security services, or SOCA (Serious Organised Crime Agency), CCTV can film and record an individual with no previous knowledge of their behaviour or criminal convictions, arguably at the complete discretion of a lone operator. This unique and very modern crime prevention strategy has provoked strong reactions from groups concerned with civil rights (Liberty: 2008), who claim that the ratio of one camera for every fourteen people in Britain represents an invasion in privacy unprecedented throughout history. Broader concern can be seen throughout society, with literature such as Utopia (1516), Brave New World (1932) and 1984 (1949) all acknowledging the issue of state surveillance at various points throughout British history. Consequently, the image of Big Brother has engrained itself into the national psyche, with Orwell’s fictitious literary creation lending its name to a popular television show concerned with constantly monitoring members of the public, fifty years after 1984’s publication.
This dramatic rise of CCTV, coupled with public concern for state surveillance facilitates the need for research concerned with the implications this modern social control practice may have.

(1c) Research Design

Three research strategies will be employed in order to gain a more complete understanding of the topic investigated. Data gathered through participant observation will be utilised, drawing upon the author’s experiences as a CCTV operator. Quantitative analysis will be conducted as a result of access to Police and control room records, as well as an analysis previously published academic literature. A triangulated research process will then be employed in order eliminate any weaknesses that may arise from one particular source of information. The research design will be discussed in greater depth in chapter six.

(1d) Content and structure

Four predetermined areas of research were established before analysis of the topic began. These areas are believed to cover the main issues related to the research topic, and can be summarised as followed:

(1) Sociological environment that facilitates the rise of the research topic;
(2) Institutional structure and characteristics of the research topic;
(3) Historical comparison of the research topic;
(4) Sociological consequences of the research topic.

Once these four research areas were established, the following theories were applied in order to allow for specific analysis:

(1) Ulrich Beck’s theory of the risk society
(2) The characteristics of bureaucracy
(3) An analysis of Jeremy Bentham’s Panopticon design
(4) Labelling theory.

This dissertation will investigate the four predetermined areas of research in reference to the four areas of theory considered pertinent to the study of CCTV.

Chapter one will provide an introduction to the purpose and aim of the dissertation, background and justification of the research topic and design, as well as addressing the four main theories considered crucial to the topics analysis.
Chapter two will begin by discussing the changing nature of risk management strategies, and how this has allowed the risk society to develop, with particular reference to techno scientific risk. Chapter three will investigate the development, structure and characteristics of bureaucracy and how critics argue its main function is to protect the production of capital.

Chapter four will analyse the design and characteristics of Jeremy Bentham’s Panopticon prison, citing it as an early example of techno scientific social control.

Chapter five is concerned with the effect that the application of labels by powerful social groups can have upon an individual’s behaviour, arguably causing self fulfilling prophecies.

Chapter six describes the Methodology implemented.

Chapter seven investigates the structure of Harrow’s CCTV control room as well as its bureaucratic characteristics and its role in the protection of capital with regards to businesses in Harrow.

Chapter eight studies the Panoptical nature of Harrow’s CCTV system, with particular reference to Michel Foucault’s analysis of the Panoptical society.

Chapter nine analyses attitudes held by operators within Harrow’s control room, and the effect the application of labels can have upon members of the public when applied by CCTV operators.

Chapter ten investigates the concept that CCTV is an example of Ulrich Beck’s Risk Society.

Chapter eleven restates the four predetermined areas of research and how they compare to the studies findings.
Chapter 2: The Management of Risk

CCTV is arguably at the forefront of societies risk management practices. It is constantly attempting to enforce effective crime control techniques with efficiency and cost effectiveness, while adhering to laws of privacy and the civil liberties of those being monitored. Consequently, it somewhere between effectiveness and intrusion that CCTV operates, raising the issue of the risk involved in its implementation.

This chapter will begin by highlighting the changing definition of risk before focussing on Ulrich Beck’s seminal work *Risk Society* (2002), which proposes a theory of risk management that has arisen throughout the latter part of the twentieth century.

(2a) The Evolution of Risk

Before discussing the concept of risk and the role it plays in contemporary social institutions, “…it is important to recognise that the meaning of risk has evolved over time”. (Mythen, 2004, 13) According to Mythen (2004), risk is a relatively modern phenomenon, entering the Western psyche within the past four hundred years. Historians argue this may have originated from Arabic word *risq* referring to “…the acquisition of wealth and good fortune”, (Skeat, 1910, cited by Mythen, 2004, 13) while others have claimed it derives from the Latin *risco*, a nautical expression reserved for the entering of uncharted waters.

The relationship between sailing and risk was later reaffirmed when the seventeenth century witnessed the union of these polar definitions within the profession of maritime insurance, as risk “…came to relate to the balance between acquisitive opportunities and potential dangers”. (Wilkinson, 2001, p.91).

Regardless of its transformation and its new found application, the definition of risk had not completed its evolution. Social factors such as the enlightenments concern with empirical observation, coupled with the momentum of the industrial revolution and its expanding bureaucratic institutions, risk became synonymous with “…statistical calculation, stock market speculation and company acquisitions” (Mythen,2004, p.13). Ulrich Beck notes how the changing definition of risk has a profound impact on the way society perceives, calculates and manages risk. Beck (1992) argues that society has passed through three distinctive historical periods that can be classified according to their reaction to the management of risk. The first, pre-industrial or traditional society, was concerned with natural hazards such as earthquakes and droughts whose occurrence was attributed to the work of external forces such as “…gods, demons or nature” (Beck,1992,p.98). This paradigm resulted in risk management being expressed through the practice of religious ceremonies to appease these external forces, such as sacrifices and rain dances.

The second period, known as industrial modernity or first modernity, followed as social awareness focussed on scientific method and the creation of industry. It was no longer the supernatural which preoccupied human concern but risks created as a result of social expansion, such as smoking, alcoholism and work related injury. This created “…a discrete pool of knowledge which exists to regulate both natural disasters and man made
risks. This is evidenced by the applied practices of health and welfare systems, environmental agencies and insurance companies” (Beck, 1992, p.98).

Beck (1992) claims that industrial modernity influenced social risk management well into the second half of the twentieth century, only transforming into our current model within the past few decades. The risk society, or second modernity, is the period that encompasses the rise of CCTV.

(2b) Techno Scientific Risk Control

The rise of the risk society is, in many ways, intrinsically linked to technological and institutional development. As humans have learnt to increasingly dominate their environment, the perceived threat of natural hazards has fallen and given way to a fear of socially manufactured risks that are “…design contingent, endogeneous entities which are generated by the practices of people, firms, state agencies and politicians” (Beck, 1992, p.98).

The increased efforts of those noted above have helped to replace modernity with what has become known as Reflex Modernisation. Proponents of this theory argue that progress and reform is achieved through the constant reanalysis of the relationship between science and industry. The utilisation of potential technological achievement is re-evaluated in light of the potential dangers that its implementation may produce, creating a new social concern for the twenty first century. This creates a risk management strategy that, unlike the two previous models, is defined by the rise of social mechanisms that are put in place to reduce the likeliness of society encountering harmful situations, only then to manufacture them as a result of increased social activity. Examples cited by Beck (1992) include the Love Canal Crisis of 1978 and the Chernobyl nuclear disaster of 1986. These incidents display the effect that supposedly safe waste disposal and clean nuclear power can have when the institutions put in place to over see their maintenance fail, resulting in manufactured social disasters. In light of this, Beck claims “The deleterious consequences of these manufactured risks span the globe, giving rise to radical changes in social structure, politics and cultural experience”. (Beck, 1998, p.12. cited by Mythen, 2004, p.5). However, the global repercussions of regional manufactured risks may also have an effect on local politics. “Decisions made at global altitude…produce knock on consequences for local activities. Similarly, local practices…generate consequences which impact in distant regions.” (Mythen, 2004, p.5)

Beck argues that the social distribution of risk, is uneven. Particular groups or perceived threats receive a disproportionate amount of concern, a practice that “…in some of its dimensions follow the inequalities of class and strata positions”. (Mythen, 2004, p.97) The increase in risk awareness and the bias manner in which it is applied creates an environment that facilitates the creation of risk towards individuals not witnessed before in either traditional or industrial society. “An increasing tendency to justify problematisation on the grounds of risk has resulted in whole new populations of respectable people being drawn into contact with enforcing authorities and mechanisms of control”( Wells, 2007, p.14).

It is important to note that though incidents such as Chernobyl have provided examples of
technological achievement that have created real dangers, Beck’ theory of the risk society does not imply that there has been an increase in risk throughout the latter part of the twentieth century, but society has organised itself to identify and neutralise risk in a manner not seen before throughout history.

In order to provide an accurate critique of CCTV’s role in Beck’s risk society and how its social institutions function as mechanisms of risk management, it is necessary to evaluate how society’s framework has transformed from the start of the industrial period onwards. “In western culture, the meaning of risk has evolved alongside the development of social institutions, the economy and the welfare state”. (Mythen, 2004,p.2) With this in mind, the next chapter will be concerned with the creation, growth and characteristics of bureaucracy.
Chapter 3: Bureaucracy and Control

The Oxford English dictionary defines bureaucracy as a “system of government in which most decisions are taken by state officials rather than by elected representatives”. These state officials are encouraged to make decisions based upon rules instead of personal judgement. In order to successfully analyze if CCTV surveillance is, in itself, a system of government exercising state power, yet done so with structured checks and balances in place, the nature of bureaucracy must first be examined.

(3a) The inevitable advance of bureaucracy

Bureaucracy has been present within Eastern and Western societies for thousands of years. It was not until the industrial revolution however when a more efficient collection and distribution of resources were required to meet the demands of increasingly complex societies. As a result of this, Max Weber (Beetham,1985, 67) claimed that patriarchal and patrimonial systems of administration were replaced by a more rational or legal approach. “This process, once begun, was irreversible” (Beetham,1985, 67).

Beetham goes on to categorise Weber’s writings as possessing two distinctive, yet overlapping concepts. The first was concerned with the nature of authority in public institutions which lay in “procedural correctness” (Beetham, 1985, 68). These procedures correctly implemented allow those subjected to authority to accept its legitimacy, regardless of the fact that, unlike previous forms of control, did not rely upon personal commitment to a ruler, but authority that is “…impersonal, involving allegiance to rules and written procedures” (Beetham,1985, 68). Secondly, this new rational legality opposed the traditional method of observing the sanctity of the past, instead “…there is in principle free scope for new enactment, provided only the formal procedures are observed”. Beetham notes how both of these characteristics are crucial to bureaucratic administration and how the official is also restrained by the new system of control. “…he is disciplined to treat like cases alike, irrespective of the personal status of the individual, and to apply rules consistently, even though he may disagree with their content.” (Beetham, 1985, 69)

As noted above, the development of institution is intertwined with industrial and capitalist progression. It is Weber’s analysis of the states use of power through capitalist enterprise that this essay’s attention now turns to. Max Weber identifies similarities between the modern state (rational/legal) and business organisations. “Like the capitalist enterprise, the modern state is a rational structure of domination and surveillance, in that it compromises a relationship between leaders and led that is mediated by bureaucracy”. (Dandeker,1990, 10) Both organisations possess legal and administrative hierarchies of whose policies can only be rectified through codified mechanisms outlined through procedure, implemented by individuals who may not agree with what they are implementing. CCTV surveillance is arguably a suitable example of the state exercising its power through bureaucracy, claiming its “…monopoly of the legitimate use of physical force within a given territory”. (Gerth and Mills cited by Dandeker,1990, 10). As a potential bureaucratic institution, it is the issue of CCTV’s potential involvement with capitalist interest that this essay will now address.
(3b) Dictatorship through bureaucracy?

Vladimir Ilyich Lenin, considered the development and maintenance of state bureaucracy, and, like Weber, considered it intertwined with the development of capitalism. Where these scholars differ is in their opinion of the bourgeois capitalist class, a group within society concerned with private capital and property gain. Weber accepted their existence as an inevitable progression following the industrial revolution, while Lenin maintained that in order to successfully complete their objectives the subordination of the lower classes (Proletariat) was necessary. In Etienne Balibar’s book, *On the Dictatorship of the Proletariat* (1997), Lenin’s argument concerning state dictatorship is classified into three parts, the third of which is concerned with the transformation of socialism into communism, and will therefore not be discussed.

**State Power**

As with other proponents of communism, Lenin argued that “State power is always the political power of a single class, which holds it in its capacity as the ruling class in society”. (Balibar,1997,60). This argument is based upon the assumption that the structure of modern society is based upon the constant struggle between the capitalist bourgeois and the proletariat, with the former always in a state of superiority over the latter.

**State Apparatus**

The economic advantage of the bourgeois is, according to Lenin, enforced through state apparatus. “State power of the ruling class cannot exist in history, nor can it be realized and maintained, without taking material form in the development and functioning of the state apparatus”. (Balibar,1997, 60) This “state machine” (Balibar,1997, 60), to use Marx’s terminology, exists in the form of the army, the police, or more notably, “…the state administration or bureaucracy” (Balibar,1997, 60). In order to gain economic advantage the proletariat was expected to destroy these institutions.

The authority under which CCTV is overseen is that of local officials, in this particular case study, Harrow Council. The power these officials exercise is not given through a mandate of its citizens, arguably qualifying them as bureaucrats. As a bureaucratic institution, it is argued that it not only shares the same characteristics as businesses, but may in fact be there to protect capitalist interest. Therefore, does the power operator’s exercise over those they monitor justify the claim that they are an administrative mechanism put in place to monitor those who may damage the states concern with protecting its capital?

This chapter has attempted to investigate the structural composition of social institutions as a result of a society preoccupied with the notion of risk, specifically technological and scientific risk. Before it is possible to apply these theories to CCTV surveillance, it is necessary that a previous social institution designed to manage risk through a system of hierarchy and procedure is studied, the Panopticon.

“…the essence of risk is not that it *is* happening, but that it *might* be happening” (Adam and van Loon, 2000 cited by Mythen, 2004, 14).
The above quote was written in reference to the risk society, though may be equally applicable to the Panopticon
This chapter will begin by briefly analysing the philosophical undercurrent of the Panopticon, before discussing its structural layout and what objectives this hopes to achieve. Foucault’s theory of a Panoptical society will then be discussed, along with other theories relating to the wider applications of Jeremy Bentham’s design. It is through analysing the theories and what later commentators have to say about them that we are able to view accurately the role of CCTV and to understand how it fits into wider aspects of policing, crime reduction and social control that are pertinent to criminology.

(4a) Bentham and the Panopticon

Political writer and philosopher Jeremy Bentham designed the Panopticon in 1787. As a proponent of utilitarian ethics, Bentham believed that humans instinctually sought pleasure and avoided pain. For Bentham, a rational system of control could be designed in order to secure the greatest number of people. The pain of punishment should, therefore, be proportional to the happiness that it secured.

“Nature has placed mankind under the governance of two sovereign masters, pain and pleasure. It is for them alone to point what we ought to do, as well as to determine what we should do”. (Bentham, 1996, 16)

Choosing the Greek name for all-seeing, Bentham attempted to create an architectural structure that would install discipline in those who worked, or were confined within its walls.

The design of Bentham’s proposed Panopticon consists of central, circular tower “…pierced with windows that open onto the inner side of the ring” (Foucault, 1979, 200). The windows are covered by blinds which are placed “…as high up as the eyes of the prisoners in their cells can, by any means they can employ, be made to reach” (Bentham, 1985, 43). This precise design ensured not only an advantage of elevation for those occupying the tower but also the inability for detainees to see those monitoring them. “He is seen, but he does not see; he is the object of information, never a subject in communication” (Foucault, 1979, 200). This one way sight line is guaranteed twenty four hours a day via “…small lamps, in the outside of each window of the lodge, backed by a reflector, to throw the light into the corresponding cells, would extend to the night the security of the day”. (Bentham, 1985, 44)

The surrounding complex is divided into individual cells separated by an “intermediate or annular area” (Bentham, 1985, 44). This area would be on the same level as the cells, which would be fitted with a window that would not only allow light to enter the cell, but unrestricted sight from the watch tower to its occupant. Bentham goes on to describe protracted partitions, which would protrude from the side of the cells preventing interaction among detainees and ensuring solitary detention. “The arrangement of his room, opposite the central tower, imposes on him an axial visibility; but the divisions of the ring, those separated cells, imply a lateral invisibility. And this invisibility is a guarantee of order” (Foucault, 1979, 200)
The Panopticon’s meticulous design reflected “…the enlightenments concern with empirical observation and observation and classification, related to the rational reproducing of social order” (Lyon, 1993, 655). This rational approach by Bentham included a realistic understanding of observation, accepting that it was not possible to monitor detainees at all times, instead relying upon the possibility of being observed at all times.

“It is obvious that, in all these instances, the more constantly the persons to be inspected are under the eyes of the persons who should inspect them, the more perfectly will the purpose X of the establishment have been attained. Ideal perfection, if that were the object, would require that each person should actually be in that predicament, during every instant of time. This being impossible, the next thing to be wished for is, that, at every instant… he should conceive himself to be so”. (Bentham, 1995, 33)

The “apparent omnipresence” (Bentham, 1995, 35) of the watcher is consequently achieved, “therefore obedience was the prisoners only rational option” (Lyon, 1993, p.656). As a result “…visibility becomes a trap” (Foucault, 1979, 200)

(4b) An Electronic Panopticon?

Michel Foucault used Jeremy Bentham’s Panopticon design as an analogy of modern society and its institutions. In his 1977 book Discipline and Punish: The Birth of the Prison, Foucault argued that societies implementation of punishment had evolved from a medieval approach based upon chastising the body to the development of administrative...
and legal hierarchies for social control. As a consequence of these developments, “Foucault holds that its principles have actually diffused through numerous social spheres”. (Lyon, 1993, 653). This is particularly relevant to Bentham’s Panopticon design and its function within contemporary social control methods. Foucault’s appreciation of Bentham’s design extended well beyond its well planned architecture, instead concentrating on its social implications of individualisation, power, and dual use of the visible and unverifiable nature of the Panopticon.

Other writers have compared Bentham’s Panopticon to contemporary social institutions, specifically those concerned with electronic or information systems. “Have computerized information systems effectively transformed Bentham’s Panoptic principle from a strategy which is only feasible in village scale settings to a routine means of mass surveillance by modern states? (Kling, 1986, 3)

David Lyons notes “…there can be little doubt that new technology is implicated in contemporary social transformations, and that this has consequences for social control” (Lyon, 1993, 654)

(4c) Five Panopticol characteristics

For the purposes of analysis, later addressed in chapter eight, the main characteristics of the Panopticon have been categorised as;

www.internetjournalofcriminology.com 14
Deterrence
The detainee is aware of being watched and adjusts their behaviour accordingly. This, coupled with Bentham’s claim that when committing an act, all individuals compare the pleasure gained with the potential pain it might cause and adjusts there behaviour according to our “…two sovereign masters” (Bentham, 1985, 16)

Efficient deployment
According to Foucault, the method in which individuals are detained make “…it possible to draw up differences among patients, to observe the symptoms of each individual…avoids any physical confrontation and which is always decided in advance”. (Foucault, 1979, 201)

Self discipline
The detainee is aware of being observed and regulates their behaviour accordingly; creating a system that is largely self- regulatory.

Presence of capable guardian
Though designed with the intention of self-regulation, the watchtower and would provide the presence of authority, even though it may be create the image of de-humanised control.

Detection
The very structure of the Panopticon is geared towards detection. There are no places in which means to hide, privacy is not a privilege extended to inmates.

The Panopticon is arguably an example of techno-scientific risk control, designed much like a bureaucratic institution in so far that it attempts to eliminate human error, in favour of predetermined rules and mechanisms. It is important to consider the experience of those being monitored and the effect this may have upon their behaviour, especially in light of the intended Panoptical goal of self-regulation. With this is mind, the next chapter is concerned with the way in which those in power can influence the actions of those they oversee, and how the subjects actions are determined by these perceptions.
The following chapter will discuss the potential effect that prejudice can have in creating labels, and how these labels can act as self fulfilling prophecies and influence an individual’s behaviour.

(5a) The label of deviance

Labelling theory argues that no behaviour is intrinsically wrong or deviant. It does however qualify as this when people in power label it as such. It has been claimed that: “Social groups create deviance by making the rules whose infraction constitutes deviance, and by applying those rules to particular people and labelling them as outsiders. From this point of view…the deviant is one to whom the label has been successfully applied…” (Becker, 1963, 4) Becker goes on to argue that the prevailing social groups, or “moral entrepreneurs” (Becker, 1963, cited in Burke, 2005, 143) who apply these labels often do so to the detriment of those considered to be outsiders. This process of labelling is invisible as “most people internalise and obey the rules without realising - or questioning the extent to which their behaviour is being decided for them” (Burke, 2005, 143). Becker (1963) also claims that there are two possible reasons for the creation of these rules. The first is simply to maintain the status quo and keep those with limited power in their place, while the second is simply an incompetent, though often sincere belief that the introduction of a new rule is advantageous to society. Two outcomes are produced as a result of applying the above. The immediate response is the creation of an outsider group, followed by the emergence of a social control agency who possess the power to label and demonise in order enforce the new rule.

According to many critics, studies have shown that labelling theory is a reality of social control. Briar (1964) analysed the way in which police officers determine what constitutes criminal behaviour when arresting suspects, and how their decisions “…are shaped by a range of extra legal variables, such as appearance, demeanour, ethnic group and age” (Burke, 2005, 145). As a consequence of this practice, young black males in certain geographical locations are “…quite simply assumed to be delinquent unless they can prove otherwise”. (Piliavin and Briar, 1964, 206, cited by Hopkins Burke, 2005, 145). Another study by Cicourel (1968) established similar findings. Stereotypical attitudes held by police officers led them to fixate their attention towards certain individuals or groups. This, Cicourel argued, was due to other control groups such as social workers and court officials emphasising external factors such as “…broken homes, permissive parenting or poverty” (Hopkins Burke, 2005, 146). This resulted in individuals from backgrounds such as these being perceived as potential criminals and receiving unjustified attention. This could arguably be an example of what Becker claimed was an incompetent, yet sincere creation of a rule designed to benefit society yet failing and demonising its citizens. Quinney (1970) suggested that four classifications were present when trying to establish what particular people would receive the label of deviant. Age, gender, class, and ethnic
group were all factors in this decision, with their culmination multiplying the chances of stigmatism. “Thus there is a high probability that a young black working class male will be defined as deviant” (Burke, 2005, 146).

(5b) The Evolution of Deviance

As new rules are introduced, they lead to “the creation of a new fragment of the moral constitution of society, its code of right and wrong” (Becker, 1963, 145). As a result of this development, previously acceptable forms of behaviour have been criminalised and those who fail to adhere to the change in political climate find themselves labelled as deviants. Platt (1969) highlights the way in which the separation of juveniles within the criminal justice was as a result of campaigning throughout the nineteenth century, the repercussions of which meant the states power extended to charges of truancy and promiscuity. Another (less controversial) example of previously acceptable behaviour transforming into deviance is that of domestic violence. Tierney (1982) describes how violence towards women only became an issue throughout the mid seventies following the impact of the women’s movement, before which it was considered a private matter.

(5c) Folk Devils and Moral Panics

As noted above, various studies have argued that labelling theory is widely practised by those in authority. However, it was the work of Stanley Cohen (1973) who first provided evidence of how stigmatising certain social groups can set in chain a motion of events that encompasses a variety of social actors. Cohen studied the way in which reports of clashes between Mods and Rockers in the Easter Holiday of 1964 were distorted and improvised, as a result of this, “Where predictions were not fulfilled, a story could still be found by reporting non events” (Cohen, 1980, 39). Burke (2005) highlights two consequences of these bias media reports; the first of which raised public concern regarding the activities of the two groups, which in turn resulted in an increase of police surveillance which led to more arrests. Second; the reports emphasised the differences within the groups which encouraged further antagonism. These findings propose that “… moral entrepreneurs exaggerate the problem in order to make local events seem ones of pressing national concern and an index of the decline of morality and social standards”. (Burke, 2005, 149). The genesis of the events noted above are a result of the deviant being “… assigned to a role or social type, perspectives develop through which he and his behaviour are visualised and explained, motives are imputed, casual patterns are searched for and the behaviour is grouped with other behaviour thought to be of the same order”. (Cohen, 1980, 74)

Piliavin, Briar and Cicourel’s studies highlight the way in which the application of labels can affect those in position of power. Cohen’s example however emphasises the transcendental nature of applying stereotypes with his analysis of deviants fulfilling the expectations of behaviour prescribed to them. Consequently, this raises the question of what further studies can support this claim, and, if they do, how likely is it to occur?
5(d) The Power of Self Fulfiling Prophecies

Sociologist Robert Merton first suggested the possibility of self fulfilling prophecies in 1948, initially analysing issues such as test anxiety and banking errors. These experiments indicated that a false social belief could influence social actors in their behaviour, resulting in confirmation of the beliefs validity. “The self-fulfilling prophecy is, in the beginning, a false definition of the situation evoking a new behaviour which makes the original false conception come 'true'. This specious validity of the self-fulfilling prophecy perpetuates a reign of error. For the prophet will cite the actual course of events as proof that he was right from the very beginning” (Merton, 1968, 477)

Later studies by Rosenthal and Jacobson (1968), provided further evidence of the effect labelling has upon a social group. Rosenthal and Jacobson (1968) conducted an experiment where teachers were led to believe that a particular group of students were “late bloomers” (Manstead and Hewstone, 1995, 509) and would display an improvement later in the academic year. IQ tests taken at various points throughout the year confirmed the studies hypothesis as the test group, especially the lower grades, improved at a more significant rate to those students whose development had not been forecast. Children in the third grade (seven to eight years old) and seventh grade (twelve to thirteen years old) were seen as the most susceptible to labelling.

Rosenthal and Jacobson’s study was concerned with the impact authority figures can have upon young people and the way in which they see themselves and their potential, though it was later work by Snyder (1974) who established a correlation between racial and gender expectation and social fulfilment. For example, when conducting interviews, studies show that “White interviewer’s racial stereotypes could undermine the performance of Black interviewees”. (Manstead and Hewstone, 1995, 511) This reciprocal interchange of expectation and action was also apparent between opposing gender groups, as males acted more warmly toward females they considered attractive which produced a warmer response in return. In conjunction with this, females were shown to display behaviour “… more consistent with traditional sex stereotypes…when interacting with a sexist male who was either physically attractive or who was interviewing them for a job…” (Manstead and Hewstone, 1995, 511).

According to the Blackwell Encyclopedia of Social Psychology, certain factors are present that “inhibit or facilitate the occurrence of self fulfilling prophecies” (Manstead and Hewstone, 1995, 513). These factors can be divided into two categories; the first of which is concerned with conditions which may influence those who apply false characteristics to a particular social group, while the second focuses on the social actors who may be influenced by such labels. The former are referred to as perceivers, while the latter as subjects.
Perceiver Characteristics

Goals
Self fulfilling prophecies are less likely to become a reality when the perceiver adopts a friendly approach to subjects. However, “…when their main goal is to arrive at a stable and predictable impression of the target, self fulfilling prophecies are more likely” (Manstaed and Hewstone, 1995, 513).

Cognitive Rigidity and Belief Certainty
This factor is concerned with how likely an individual is to “alter their beliefs when confronted with disconfirming evidence”. (Manstead and Hewstone, 1995, 513) Individuals who are resistant or unwilling to revise their opinions or beliefs are more likely to create a self fulfilling prophecy, “…especially if they are in high power or high status positions, teacher, employer, parent, etc…” (Manstead and Hewstone, 1995, 513)

Subject Characteristics

Self Concept
“Unclear self perceptions lead people to become more vulnerable to social influences in general, including self fulfilling prophecies” (Manstead and Hewstone, 1995, 513) However, when subjects possess clear perceptions of themselves they are not only more less likely to conform to stereotypes directed towards them, but convince perceivers to view them as they wished to be viewed.

Goals
A subject’s susceptibility is very much dependant upon their personal goals. If, for example, a subject requires something bestowed by the perceiver, such as a job, they are more likely to conform to behaviour expected of them. Similarly, if targets possess goals separate from the perceiver, though they are still subject to negative stereotypes, “…they often act to disconfirm that belief”. (Manstead et al, 1995, 513).

Age
Very much linked with self concept, studies by Rosenthal and Jacobson (1968) highlight the way in which younger members of a social group are more impressionable than older members, particularly those leaving childhood and entering their teenage years. As a consequence of this they are more susceptible to self fulfilling prophecies.

New Situations
“People may be more susceptible to conforming to others expectations when they enter new situations. Whenever people engage in major life transitions, such as entering a new school or starting a new job, they may be less clear and confident in their self perceptions…” (Manstead and et al, 1995, 514)
This chapter will outline the methods used to answer the research questions set out in chapter one.

(6a) Subjective Motivational Factors

Schwartz and Jacobs (1979) coined the term “true confessions” (Schwartz & Jacobs, 1979, 97). This was in reference to the initial bias and theoretical orientation held by researchers that inspired them to conduct a particular study, and the need to recognise this before any results can be compiled.

The author would like to acknowledge the personal interest gained in CCTV as a result of being employed as an operator since September 2002. The author recognises favourable bias towards CCTV that has formed as a result of six years of engaging in the apprehension of offenders who have committed offences considered immoral and at times disturbing to the author.

(6b) Research setting and subjects

This study was concerned with the procedures of the London Borough of Harrow’s CCTV control room, and how the actions and attitudes of those implementing them affected the subjects of surveillance.

The actions and opinions of eight operators (including the author) and the control manager were reflected upon, with their participation in the study being made fully aware to them up to eighteen months before it was conducted.

As an employee, the author was able to gain access to an otherwise closed research area. Bryman (2004:296) notes that those wishing to conduct ethnographic research should be prepared to comprise regarding access to the research topic, it was felt however that six years of employment within Harrow’s control room allowed the author to assimilate into the control room dynamic. This allowed the fulfilment of Gubrium and Holstein’s (1997) condition of Naturalism when conducting qualitative research, seeking to “…understand social reality in its own terms; as it really is, providing rich descriptions of people and interaction in natural settings”. (Bryman, 2004, 267)

(6c) Multiple Strategic Approach

The process of triangulation was implemented throughout this study, combing both quantitative and qualitative data. This approach, originally devised by Webb et al. (1966), hoped to employ “…the development of measures of concepts, whereby more than one method would be employed in the development of measures, resulting in greater confidence in findings”. (Bryman, 2004, 275)
**Participant Observation**

A reflective analysis of the experience gained through employment as a CCTV operator was utilised by the author. This approach encompassed elements of *reflexivity* as outlined by Boyle (1994), recognising that the “…researcher understands that he or she is part of the social world that he or she investigates” (Berg, 2007, 178). The data gathered consisted of the personal recollection of events as witnessed by the author as well as interaction with fellow operators. It was felt that given the personal and professional relationships formed with colleagues over six years, more overt methods of data retrieval such as questionnaires may have promoted unnatural responses. Instead, a role of *total participation* as outlined by Gans (1968) was employed. This constitutes the ethnographer being “…completely involved in a certain situation and has to resume a researcher stance once the situation has unfolded and then write down notes.” (Bryman, 2004, 302)

Critics argue that participant observation prevents researchers from objectively conducting research, therefore influencing the results. Studies by Waddington (1994) and Venkatesh (1989) refute this claim. Waddington’s involvement in strike action in Birmingham during the 1980s, triangulated with other data sources, showed “…how the contemporary beliefs, values and attitudes of the workforce…were shaped by a sequence of historical events stretching back over 20 years.” (Waddington, 1994, 115 cited by Bryman, 2004, 282) Venkatesh (1989) adopted a similar approach when infiltrating a gang in Chicago, becoming so involved that he was made gang leader for a day.
These studies highlight the need for *Emotionalism*, as categorised by Gubrium and Holstein (1997), when conducting research.

“... a concern with subjectivity and gaining access to inside experience, concern with the inner reality of human beings”. (Bryman, 2004, 267)

**CAD and control room data**

An analysis of incident records as recorded by Harrow’s control room has been conducted, covering the period of the 1st April to 1st June 2006. These records were supplied by the manager of the control room at the request of the author, hoping to provide objective data that can be triangulated with the more subjective experiences of participant observation. These records were analysed by the author, and converted into statistical data regarding race, gender and location of offences (Statistics produced possess a margin of error of one percent, due to rounding up). Once compiled, this data was presented to Harrow’s crime reduction unit who produced an *ArcMap* illustration of geographic location of offences (Fig 5), as recorded by CCTV, as well an illustration of all incidents recorded by the Police covering the same period. These images were constructed using *Arc View Map Info*.

Throughout the research process, it became apparent that the data collected from the control room may possess human error and represent the bias of controllers towards certain social groups. It also became apparent that approximately one tenth of the incidents recorded were done so by the author, undermining the objectivity of the statistical data. The *ArcMap* images were created by a secondary source, with the aid of computer software not familiar to author. They also reflect any mistakes made throughout the collection, and analysis of the raw data.

**Previous Research**

As well as participant observation and statistical analysis, broader academic studies are also considered. These theories, as outlined in chapter one, provide a framework in which to analyse a vast area of subject matter, encompassing the historical development of institutions and the effects that social control mechanisms have upon contemporary Britain. The high quality of this secondary data has “…been generated by highly experienced researchers” (Bryman, 2004, 202) Examples of this used include Cohen and Felson’s (1979) Routine Activity Theory, and research conducted by NACRO (National Association for the Care and Resettlement of Offenders).
Chapter 7: Bureaucracy and CCTV

This chapter will investigate these claims in relation to Harrow’s control room, beginning with an analysis of procedure and how vigorously it is adhered to, followed by a discussion regarding its hierarchal structure. Finally, the relationship between the control room and local businesses will be reviewed.

(7a) Bureaucracy and the control room

The London Borough of Harrow’s CCTV control room is situated on the second floor of the Civic centre. As with all areas of the building, the floor in which the control room is located is only accessible via an electronically locked door requiring a programmed swipe card. Unlike other offices sharing this floor however, the control room door has a large sign attached to it informing people that access is denied except to restricted personnel. To further enforce this policy, a numbered code is required to be inputted into another electronic lock which, when done correctly, will allow access.

Upon entering the control room for the first time, many are taken aback by the sheer volume of technology on display. With over one hundred and fifty six monitors, six hard drives, two computers, two large LCD monitors cycling through various cameras, and the constant crackle of police and town link radio’s, many individuals comment philosophically at the progression modern technology has made. One feature generally overlooked however is the number of filling cabinets on display, containing the large amount of paper work necessary for the room to function to the standards of local government.

One form constantly on display is the access sheet. Required to be filled out “Regardless of rank”, it states “Could all those entering please provide the following information: name, time of entrance, reason for entrance, contact details”. In practice, with various individuals entering the room for various reasons, such as maintenance, waste removal, human resources and financing, the required signing of the access book is generally ignored. Curiously however, high ranking police officers visiting the control room hoping to gain an overview of its operation (having possibly been recently assigned to the borough), or lower ranking police officers collecting evidence they have requested, are consistently requested to provide the necessary information. One would assume that individuals employed in law enforcement would already possess an understanding for the need for discretion when entering restricted areas, and consequently be more likely to be exempt from such a procedure, as opposed to individuals not recognised by operators who are presumed to work in the civic centre. This inconsistency in the application of procedure is a consequence of professional courtesy. Operators, when dealing with external groups reliant upon their services, are eager to display correct due process, a concern not extended to groups considered irrelevant to the reduction of crime.

As briefly noted above, one of the duties of the control room is to compile and document evidence on behalf of the police. This is achieved via the use of computer software known as a RAID system (Redundant Array of Inexpensive Disks), which digitally records all information over one hundred and fifty six cameras within Harrow town centre, Northolt Road, Wealdstone and the civic centre, over fifty six hard drives. This
highly efficient method of data retrieval requires only the input of date, time and camera number to instantly access any footage recorded over the past thirty one days, after which it is erased. The RAID system was installed in May 2006, before which the viewing of data involved the “pulling” of individual tapes which required approximately twenty minutes of paper work documenting the time the tape was pulled, reason for removal, shoulder number of officer requesting viewing, and crime reference number involved in incident under investigation. However, before this procedure could be implemented, a new tape had to be inserted in its place which would require the completion of further paperwork, predominately concerned with reaffirming the information listed above. Further information was also required regarding the erasure of the replacement tape and the completion of two separate sheets concerned with the cataloguing of the two tapes in question. The logic associated with these procedural requirements is self evident when considering the sensitive data handled and the implications its use may have, regardless of its time consumption. However, review of procedural efficiency led to the implementation of the RAID system within the control room, not only eliminating large sections of paperwork (still required to state why footage is viewed), but also improving operator willingness to review large amounts of data due to improved accessibility. Through adhering to correct procedure Harrow’s control room was able to review its performance and reform in order to improve efficiency, symbolising Beetham’s claim regarding Weber’s analysis of the “…scope for new enactment, provided only the correct procedures are observed”. (Beetham, 1985, 69)

Operators are requested to record copies of disks if successfully identifying criminal acts on the RAID system, an act which requires the completion of three further documents. The first is concerned with keeping an internal record of recordings made, and the second is attached to the disk and placed inside the police issued evidence bag describing the date, time, incident recorded, along with a crime reference number and shoulder number of the officer collecting the tape. This piece of documentation is imprinted with a personalised serial number, along with the information requested on the form. Upon being sealed in front of the officer collecting the evidence, and co signed by both parties, it is no longer the property of Harrow’s control room but of the Metropolitan police. Unlike the access sheet, the procedures outlined above are enforced vigorously and in all cases by those working within the control room. When beginning employment within CCTV, it is made very clear from the earliest opportunity that the collection and documentation of evidence is of the up most importance, with any errors throughout the process potentially resulting in failure to secure a conviction in a trial. This emphasis on correct procedure can often result in operators filling out various forms and evidence bags in order to eliminate the possibility of handwriting being misread, as well as asking colleagues to proof read them as an extra precaution. It is largely for the same reason that this precaution is exercised as that of requesting officers to sign access sheets, as the control rooms effectiveness is largely judged by outsiders who are reliant upon it, therefore any external perception in the breakdown of procedure is seen as a breakdown in effectiveness.
(7b) The Structure of the Control Room

Through conversations with fellow operators, and reflecting upon personal experience, it became apparent that the three lower tiers are very much segregated, not only in duties performed but geographical location. Operators, the supervisor and the manager occupy the control room and rarely come into contact with any other members of the civic centre hierarchy. Arguably, this situation is reflective of a business organisation whose workers rarely come into contact with higher management.

One of the roles mid ranking members of the civic hierarchy (Manager, Service manager and Head of Community Safety Service) perform is displaying the effectiveness of CCTV to members of the government, home office and police in order to secure funding for the maintenance and progression of the institution. When one considers this in relation to the role of mid ranking members of business organisations, and their focus on profit through advertisement and market research, the relationship between state bureaucracy and business becomes apparent.

Those occupying the top strata of the civic hierarchy are the Councillors. These representatives are elected by the people of Harrow according to political allegiance, and subsequently do not qualify as bureaucrats. Their duties consist of chairing meetings between lower levels of management who report back on the progression of CCTV, both financially and in terms of crime reduction, along with the relationship the department currently has with those reliant upon the system. The Councillors are not involved with the day to day management of the CCTV department, though they do represent the political ethos which encourages it existence by helping to enforce government policy in reference to CCTV. Regarding the duties listed above, a board of directors or managing director may have a similar relationship with those occupying lower levels of a business structure, in terms of gathering necessary information summarising the performance of
each department, and in guiding the general ethos of the institution. With this in mind, it is necessary to ask whether CCTV, as a predominately bureaucratic organisation whose characteristics are similar to those of business organisations, functions as the state machine protecting capitalist interest.

(7c) CCTV: The protector of capitalism?

Operators within Harrow’s control room are required to use three radios in order to perform their duties. The first enables communication between members of security working within the Civic centre, and the second is a Police radio which gives operators the ability to respond to matters brought to their attention via emergency calls, along with initiating contact when witnessing a situation requiring immediate attention. The Civic radio is rarely used unless Police assistance is required, while the police radio is used more frequently throughout the day. The third radio, known as the town link, connects the control room to one hundred and twenty shops in Harrow’s town centre.

Of the 1260 incidents recorded by operators between April and June 2006, use of the Civic radio represented 3% (38 incidents) of usage, while use of the police and town link radio displayed 29% (365 incidents) and 42% (529 incidents). With nearly a half of incidents recorded involving interaction between CCTV and local business, it would initially suggest that nearly half of the capability of the control room is assigned to overseeing the protection of local business. However, further investigation challenges this theory.
The author would like to note that incidents recorded by the police are as a result of emergency calls from the public, (then assigned a CAD number for reference) or crimes witnessed by officers while on duty. Incidents recorded by CCTV represent the exchange of information between the control room, the police and local businesses, which are then written in the incident book.

An analysis of the information gathered by the police and represented in figure 5 displays a broader spread of criminal activity than that of the control room. Notably, there seems to be to more activity within the area of Wealdstone, most likely due to the incidents being reported emanating from a densely populated residential area which encompass a large number of crimes not applicable to CCTV.

One particular hotspot identified by CCTV yet not reflected within the police records is that concerning the area of St.George’s and St. Ann’s shopping centres. These two complexes, which are in close proximity to other large stores such as Debenhams and Marks and Spencers, represent the most obvious area of incidents recorded by Harrow’s control room, possibly justifying Lenin and Marx’s claim regarding the role of state apparatus. Upon closer inspection however, it would appear that this issue is more complicated than the state simply protecting its capital.
Saint John’s churchyard represents a large number of recorded incidents by both the Police and the control room (Fig 5). This can almost entirely be attributed to the actions of those who occupy its benches from early morning to late at night. These individuals, who are well known to operators and the Police (a point later addressed in chapter eight) suffer from either alcoholism or drug addiction, and in some cases, both. In order to gain money in which to purchase either alcohol or drugs, many of the individuals who occupy St. John’s churchyard engage in theft, specifically targeting shops within St. Ann’s or St. George’s shopping centre, and very rarely targeting members of the public. This situation possesses elements more commonly associated with Cohen and Felson’s Routine activities theory (1979) than that of Lenin’s dictatorship of the proletariat. This theory states that for a predatory crime to occur, three elements must be present. The first is a suitable target (shops), the second, lack of a suitable guardian (security guards), and the third, a motivated offender (occupants of St. John’s). Regarding the second criteria, it is possible that even though security and CCTV represent suitable guardians, the nature of the offender’s addiction makes it a crime of physiological necessity, which negates the deterrence factor. Similar studies undertaken by the Home office (1993) conclude that the repeated targeting of high street stores in Hartlepool (not seen in other retail outlets) is due to “…cash and readily saleable finished goods furnishing attractive targets…high street service providers may also offer fairly rich, accessible pickings in the form of cash and equipment”. (Tilley, 1993, 7)

When one considers these findings in relation to Harrow’s CCTV system it would appear that its communication with the retail sector is as a reaction to locally motivated offenders and readily available goods, not a predetermined stance on protecting the production of capital.

Curiously, Harrow’s Civic centre represents an area of frequent activity for the police, yet not for the control room. This is strange when one considers the control room is situated on the second floor of the Civic centre which has 96 cameras viewing the civic centre at the operator’s disposal. The Police are frequently called here to deal with situations related to role of a Civic centre with members of the public disgruntled at a variety of issues such as housing, benefits, tax etc… These issues go largely unrecorded by operators, representing only 3% (38 incidents) of all radio communication conducted. As noted in above, some procedures are largely ignored unless they are required to be externally held to account, which may suggest that even though the control room has the capacity to vigorously protect itself from those who have an issue with the state, it chooses not to. This undermines Lenin’s argument regarding the state machine being assembled to protect itself, as in this particular case, it clearly does not.

The next chapter will investigate the claim that modern CCTV is Panoptical in its function.
This chapter will investigate Harrow’s control room with reference to the Panopticon’s design and function.

(8a) An Electronic Panopticon?

The Panopticon’s central circular tower, which would contain the guards, could theoretically be compared to Harrow’s control room. This secluded room not only segregates operators from those being monitored but also from fellow workers within the Civic centre, much the same way the Panopticon’s tower would have in relation to other prison workers such as cooks, cleaners etc… The circular design of the watchtower ensures a panoramic view of the cells, eliminating angles, corners and general interruptions to the guard’s line of sight. The way in which the viewing monitors within the control room (Fig 6) are laid out display similar intent, with their placement ensuring a panoramic view stopped short due the limits of the operator’s peripheral vision. This semi-circular design is implemented due to the impracticality of the alternative, full circle layout, which would involve operators perpetually spinning on their chairs in order to perform their duties. The ability to transfer a camera’s image to a monitor directly in front of the operator is utilised instead, ensuring the clearest possible view of the intended target.

---

Fig 6: Photograph of the London Borough of Harrow’s CCTV control room
This panoramic layout intersected with fifty six monitors can at times feel as if one is monitoring fifty six individual cells. When a subject enters a particular cameras range, they do in effect enter a cell, leaving the “…intermediate or annular” (Bentham, 1985, 44) area of Harrow’s town centre and its crowds behind, becoming individualised, the subject of closer analysis. This analysis may come in the form of an operator speculating as to the intentions of the subject, and what action to take as a response to the fulfilment of those actions.

It is worth speculating as to the reaction Bentham may have had at such an efficient use of space, technology and general consideration to the capabilities of human vision. It is very likely to have been a positive one.

Other visual factors considered by Bentham may also be present within the technology that defines the term Closed Circuit Television. Alternative methods of communication such as radio, mobile phones and terrestrial television allow access to a variety of individuals through open circuits, unlike CCTV which closes access to those not considered pertinent to the surveillance process. This ensures a one way sight line between the observer and the observed, which results in the latter being “…an object of information, never a subject in communication” (Foucault, 1979, 200). This is particularly true when one considers the actions of Middlesbrough City Council, who have taken advantage of the recent technological developments of CCTV by installing cameras fitted with microphones allowing operators to verbally rebuke members of the public. Further technological capabilities that allow CCTV systems to operate include lenses designed to automatically focus according to the time of day. This ensures images captured throughout the night make it possible to clearly identify those involved in criminal activity, resulting in a system “…that would extend to the night the security of the day”. (Bentham, 1787, 44)

According to Bentham, it was not realistic to assume that individuals could be monitored at all times. Alternatively, it was the possibility of being monitored that would ensure correct behaviour through self regulation. Regarding CCTV, this Panopticol characteristic is present, but not in its entirety. For example, when an individual becomes aware that they are in the path of the cameras line of sight, there is no guarantee that an operator is viewing that particular camera. This knowledge, coupled with the possibility that data recorded on the particular camera in question may be retrieved at a later date, results in a potential offender reconsidering their actions regardless of the fact that a human observer may not be present. However, unlike the Panopticon, potential offenders can see the direction in which a camera is facing, avoiding the line of sight and attempt to go undetected in the completion of their task. This situation can often arise within Harrow town centre as those who occupy St.John’s churchyard employ this tactic when attempting to access stores in which they have previously been banned from.

Alternatively, individuals may stand directly underneath the camera, aware of the existence of a blind spot for operators due to the cameras inability to look directly down. This does not result in obedience being the subject’s only rational option, (Lyon, 1993, 656) or visibility becoming a trap, (Foucault, 1979, 200) as invisibility can at times be achieved.
For the purposes of clearer analysis, it is to the five Panopticol characteristics as outlined in chapter four that this essay now turns its attention to.

**Deterrance**
“The offender become aware of the presence of CCTV, assesses the risks of offending in this location to outweigh the benefits and chooses either not to offend or to offend elsewhere” (Armitage, 2002, 2)

This statement, made by Rachel Armitage on behalf of NACRO highlights the Utilitarian nature of CCTV. Offenders outweigh the pleasure gained from causing an offense against the pain that may occur as a result of being caught. This may also be interpreted as the likeliness of one being caught.

**Efficient deployment**
“CCTV cameras allow those monitoring the scene to determine whether police assistance is required. This ensures that police resources are called upon only when necessary”. (Armitage, 2002, 2)

Of the 1260 incidents recorded between April and June 2006, 131 (10.4%) of these involved the deployment of police officers. Of these 131 incidents, 117 (89.3%) resulted in arrests. Very often, when officers were on their way to an incident, they were aware of the circumstances of the offence and what to expect due to CCTV coverage. This could result in specialist units such as firearms or dog handlers being dispatched in order to improve upon efficiency. As a consequence of this, Foucault’s statement regarding the Panopticon, that “…it is possible to draw up differences among patients, to observe the symptoms of each individual…avoids any physical confrontation and which is always decided in advance”, (Foucault, 1979, 200) may be justified in reference to CCTV. It must be noted however, of the 1260 incidents, 18 (1.4%) consisted of requests made to police officers to attend, though were unable to due to lack of available officers. When compared to incidents attended, they represent a failure to attend rate of 18 out of 131 (13.7%). Though this number is relatively small compared to issues successfully dealt with, the very existence of issues that are unable to be addressed does not embody the design of the Panopticon which could presumably intervene in any given situation. This is however an issue specific to the police and not CCTV, along with being a complication that may arise due to the practices of “…village scale settings …being applied to …a routine means of mass surveillance by modern states? (Kling, 1986, 3)

**Self discipline**
Bentham claimed that power should be visible and verifiable. Visible in so far that the threat of detection was always possible, though unverifiable regarding the inmates knowledge of being viewed. As discussed above, CCTV fulfills these criteria though not in its entirety.

**Presence of capable guardian**
Routine activity theory suggests that in order for a predatory crime to take place, the absence of a capable guardian is a condition that must be met, and in the Panopticon’s
case, the tower and the guards that occupy it would embody this role. In many circumstances, the presence of CCTV can also embody the role of guardian. There are circumstances such as drug addiction, or alcohol related violence that result in offenders either ignoring or become unaware of CCTV.

Detection
“CCTV cameras capture images of offences taking place. In some cases this may lead to punishment and the removal of the offenders’ ability to offend (either due to incarceration, or increased monitoring and supervision). The latter mechanism is by far the most publicized, with high-profile cases such as the abduction and murder of James Bulger and the arrest of David Copeland, in which images of the offenders on CCTV aided their detection and subsequent arrest”. (Armitage, 2002, 2)
Rachel Armitage’s statement explains the role of detection within CCTV. This is very similar to the way in which the emphasis on detection, or the illusion of detection, was a key feature of the Panopticon.

The next chapter will investigate CCTV in relation to labelling theory as discussed in chapter five.
This chapter will begin by providing an overview of the attitudes held by operators within Harrow’s control room, and how they are applied to those being monitored by using Richard Quinney’s four extra legal variables, as well as considering the broader issues associated with labelling.

(9a) Control room attitudes

When beginning employment within CCTV, it is common practice that an experienced operator will be assigned the task of guiding and training those who may not possess any experience within this field. Much of the training involves the completion of procedures as outlined in chapter seven, which consists of predetermined actions based upon a rational/legal approach to allow accurate record keeping, evidence collecting etc… However, one aspect of training covered involves the detection and surveillance of potential offenders, and, unlike certain procedural requirements, possess no formal guidelines that may be followed. Consequently this aspect of operator training is largely subjective and influenced by the personal opinions and experiences of those conducting the training.

With this in mind, Richard Quinney’s four extra legal variables will be considered in relation to attitudes present within the control room and how this may effect the actions of those being monitored.

Age
The practice of targeting young people in CCTV surveillance is so overt and widespread in its implementation that it is rarely discussed as an issue within the control room, and certainly does not raise the same ethical and political concern that the targeting of other social groups may. When one considers the documentation of racial category, gender and clothes worn within the incidents sheets of the control room, yet not the approximate age of the targets, it becomes apparent that age is not a factor when compiling information regarding those recorded by CCTV. It is therefore impossible to present empirical, objective data representing the age of those documented on the incident sheets, instead a reflective approach based upon the author’s experience is the focus of this particular section of the essay.

Operators are vocally offensive when discussing young targets, often referring to them as “scouts” or “little shits”, regardless of whether they have engaged in criminal activity or not. These labels are not manifested as frequently or as cynically when discussing other social groups as they would be interpreted as unprofessional to the point of being immoral, and would undoubtedly result in disciplinary action if they were to occur.

It should be acknowledged that a disproportionate number of offences are caused by those under the age of twenty one (in the opinion of the author), though the level of attention given to this age group is equally disproportionate. For example, the period covering three thirty pm and approximately six pm is considered to be one of the busier periods of an operators shift, specifically due to teenagers leaving school and returning home. During this time, operators target those in school uniforms, and particularly those
considered to be loitering around the bus or train station. It would be hard to imagine office workers targeted in the same way between the period of five pm and eight pm, even though they may occupy the same locations as the school children when attempting to go home.

A consequence of this disproportionate surveillance is that many young people become aware that they are being monitored, which often results in a mischief response. This may involve deliberately acting covertly in front of the cameras, or deliberately acting overtly by swearing or mouthing obscenities. As a result of this, operators often comment on their actions through similar obscenities, essentially confirming their original suspicion that these individuals warrant monitoring. This self fulfilling prophecy possesses a variety of factors as outlined by in chapter five, most notably the hostile mentality towards the subjects (teenagers) and rigid cognition preventing changes in opinion. From the perspective of the subjects, there age may result in a lack of self concept which does not facilitate the need to disprove negative labels or force others to view them in a positive way.

**Gender**

Monitoring individuals in relation to gender is very much dependant upon the particular crime an operator wishes to prevent. For example, females tend to be targeted when in the vicinity of and entering stores and shopping centres, as shoplifting and theft is considered a feminine crime within Harrow’s control room. Furthermore, women with pushchairs are paid particularly close attention to as this equipment is seen to allow the concealment of goods, whereas men with children are largely ignored as they are not seen to pose a threat. In relation to groups congregating, females are largely ignored (unless thought to possess intent to enter shops) while groups of males are essentially presumed guilty when loitering, often resulting in Police officers requesting they move on, only then to congregate again close by.

The way in which females dress also has a notable effect upon the attention they receive from operators, with those wearing skirts and dresses not considered the “type” of women to cause crime, as opposed to those wearing hooded tops, jeans, or more gender neutral attire. Women considered to be more effeminate receive less attention from male operators as, if the tapes are reviewed (done so approximately every six months) then the issue of a male operator monitoring an attractive female without just cause may raise more questions than a male operator monitoring a suspect seen to fit a more traditional criminal profile.

Of the 2650 individuals involved in 1260 incidents recorded between April and June 2006, 1033 (39%) of these were female, with 661 (64%) of these females involved, or suspected to be involved in theft, shoplifting or fraud.

1617 (61%) of the suspects were male, and displayed more varied criminal activity than females, notably assault, motor vehicle offences, offensive weapons etc…

Labelling is undeniably present regarding gender, ranging across a variety of different issues such as, types of crime, dress sense, and even involves notions of chivalry. There is however little evidence to suggest that these factors create self fulfilling prophecies among females as much of the crime related to this gender, as recorded by CCTV, is
predominately related to material gain, whereas crimes committed by males often encompass issues of status (gang fighting, robbing, etc...). This issue of status creates a far more hospitable environment for self fulfilling prophecies to occur, as those males seen to engage in criminal activity such as robbing tend to do so in gangs and not out of economic necessity. For example, records of incidents show that there is not a single case of an occupant of St.John’s churchyard robbing a member of the public in order to secure funds to pay for their addiction, instead the vast majority of street robbing is performed by gangs of young males who, upon being stopped by the police, often already possess items taken off victims, such as mobile phones, I Pods, etc... These males are nearly all of the age that would suggest they still live with their parents, so the financial demand of supporting themselves is not likely to be a factor. This would imply that much of male crime within Harrow is status driven, which may be created as a result of increased targeting by police and operators which helps to define as members of an outsider group.

Class
Unlike gender, age or race, class is not based upon biological characteristics but consists of a variety of socially constructed factors. Harrow’s control room operators often target individuals according to class, though they tend to do so according to dress and body language.

One label often used within the control is the word “chav”. This applies to young, white, working class males who often dress in sporting clothing, and though Asians or Afro-Caribbean males may fulfil all of the above criteria, it is only white male’s who receive this label. In no other circumstances within the control room are any other racial group referred to specifically in a derogatory manner, as this would more than likely result in immediate dismissal. These “chavs” are often monitored when congregated in groups of more than three, receiving far more attention from operators than individuals wearing clothes associated more with middle class tastes (collared shirts, shoes, trousers etc...) Afro-Caribbean’s and Asians also receive more attention from operators when dressed in clothes similar to those labelled as “chavs”, though this is regarded as somewhat more acceptable for ethnic minorities to do so, suggesting that white people should have higher standards of dress than non-whites.

The application of labels related to image and fashion can create somewhat of an outsider mentality for its recipients, aiding the creation of “street culture”, seen in previous studies concerned with the Mods and Rockers (Cohen, 1973). Features of these sub cultures include hostility towards authority figures which is arguably as a result of the initial hostility shown towards them. Examples of this within Harrow include individuals pretending to pass items to each other in a discreet manner which results in the police being dispatched with the hope of apprehending drug dealers. After performing searches, no items are found, the police leave the scene and the targeted groups then “mock” the cameras. This is arguably due to a sense of satisfaction gained from being perceived as being deviant, or part of an outsider group.
According to statistical reports compiled by Watson (2004) on Harrow Council, 59% of residents are white, with 49% encompassing all other ethnic groups. Interestingly, 7% of residents are of Afro-Caribbean origin, yet they represent 23.7% of subjects targeted by CCTV, due to operators associating them with street robberies. These findings contrast with 30% of residents being of Asian (Indian, Pakistani etc…) origin yet representing approximately the same percentage of control room targeting at 26.8%. These statistical anomalies imply that increased targeting may occur according to race, though this practice tends to occur in relation to specific crimes. For example, 224 of the 243 (92%) IC5 targets (Chinese, Japanese etc…) are recorded as selling illegal DVDs within Harrow. This illegal street trading is conducted by Chinese immigrants smuggled into Britain by criminal gangs, resulting in the arrest of the sellers being ineffective when trying to prevent piracy, as criminal gangs are able to find replacements easily. As a consequence of this, the selling of illegal DVDs is largely ignored by both the police and CCTV operators. However, as mentioned in chapter seven, the incident book serves as a record of the work completed by operators, with a lack of entries being associated with poor performance. This results in operators targeting street traders in order to provide examples of pro active surveillance, inadvertently manufacturing statistical evidence that help to magnify the issue of IC5’s involved in piracy. These “…reports of non-events” (Cohen, 1980, 38) create the illusion of empirical data, which helps to reinforce stereotypes towards the Chinese community.
This chapter will investigate the role of CCTV in light of Ulrich Beck’s theory of the Risk Society.

(10a) Techno Scientific Risk

Ulrich Beck claimed that the rise of the risk society occurred throughout the latter part of the twentieth century, replacing previous risk management strategies. This coincides with the development of technology that has allowed investment within CCTV throughout the past decade, with the sight of cameras becoming a common feature of most urbanised areas. This development can be largely attributed to the flow of information between scientific manufacturers concerned with improving information systems, and industrialists such as Quadrant, who install and maintain equipment for Harrow’s CCTV system.

As the notion of risk has evolved throughout history so has society’s ability to manage it. Following threats from the IRA emanating from the conflict in Northern Ireland, the City of London implemented a surveillance defence network which became known as the Ring of Steel. Roads were made narrower in order to force drivers entering central London to slow down so that their vehicles could be recorded on CCTV. This design, often referred to as “fortress urbanism” (Lipton, 2005), symbolises a society increasingly concerned with global issues and tackling them through a system of techno-scientific risk control, sharing much of the same qualities as the Panopticon. Global concerns provide the catalyst for this change, with events occurring in different continents affecting local activities, which, in turn, affect global politics. An example of this can be seen in the city of London’s reactivation of the Ring of Steel following the terrorist attacks of September 11th, a response that extended to Harrow’s control room as IC6 members of the public became targets of surveillance regarding global issues, which were in stark contrast to other control room concerns of shoplifting, fraud etc… This exchange of information was reflected in CCTV, as images of the July 7th 2005 bombers entering Luton station were quickly broadcast around the world, prompting a variety of responses from a variety of political factions.

It has also been argued that the distribution of risk management throughout society is disproportionate to the actual level of risk present. Chapter nine highlighted the way in which certain social groups often become the focus of unjustified surveillance, as seen in the case of Chinese immigrants involved in piracy on the streets of Harrow. This is yet another example of international concerns regarding organised crime and people trafficking effecting local policies, which in turn may become reflected as opinions towards Asian members of Harrow are then applied as broad racial stereotypes. In this respect, CCTV, “…in some of its dimensions, follows the inequalities of class and strata positions”. (Mythen, 2004, p.97) Consequently, “…whole new populations of respectable people are drawn into contact with enforcing authorities and mechanisms of control” (Wells, 2007, 14).

CCTV has reformed and progressed on numerous occasions throughout its history, with notable success at the implementation of the RAID system. This re-evaluation of
bureaucratic procedure and scientific possibility has undeniably improved efficiency within Harrow’s control room, arguably symbolizing the process of reflex modernization. Critics argue however that these advances are a detriment to society as they undermine basic human rights and prevent social cohesion through fragmenting social groups from mainstream culture. If these arguments were true, CCTV’s implementation would work counter productively and not help to reduce crime or create a safer society, but become comparable to other social projects that have failed and left their mark on the social psyche.
(11a) Research topics

Before summarizing any results found, it is necessary to readdress the broader research concerns as outlined in chapter one. These are;

(1) Sociological environment that facilitates the rise of the research topic;
(2) Institutional structure and characteristics of the research topic;
(3) Historical comparison of the research topic;
(4) Sociological consequences of the research topic.

(11b) Findings

Institutional structure and characteristics of the research topic

CCTV is a largely bureaucratic organisation. Though the head of its institutional structure may be elected by the residents of Harrow, in practice, the higher levels of management rarely come into contact with those charged with conducting surveillance. This divide in the occupational hierarchy of the control room, coupled with its geographical isolation, helps to create somewhat of a separatist or autonomous government agency. Procedures designed to install a system of checks and balances are often implemented at the discretion of those whose actions the procedures are meant to hold to account. This exercise in discretion may be implemented by the individual, though there does seem to be an uncodified procedure among operators that states, albeit subtly,

(1) any procedural mechanism imposed upon the control room for the purposes of internally regulating the control room, will be implemented at the discretion of the operators working, however;
(2) any procedure that may be witnessed by those external to the control room, or reliant upon the work of the control room, shall be implemented in all cases.

This situation presents Harrow’s CCTV control room as being somewhat of an autonomous bureaucracy, with the freedom to implement procedure at the workers discretion on occasion being superseded by a more traditional bureaucracy as outlined by Weber.

Critics of bureaucratic organisations, such as Lenin, argued that its creation and maintenance ensured the protection of the states production of capital and the social position of those overseeing it. However, a study of the control room’s reaction to crimes against businesses, triangulated with data from Harrow’s police data, revealed a social control practice more commonly associated with Routine Activity theory, as well as displaying the states lack of concern regarding those challenging its authority.

The study of bureaucracy and CCTV, though of particular interest to the author, displayed mixed results when comparing the theory to the research topic. It did however raise the issue of Routine Activity theory within CCTV, which warrants further study.

Historical comparison of the research topic
Bentham’s Panopticon design was judged to share numerous physical and theoretical similarities with CCTV surveillance. The physical layout of the control room suggested design features consistent with the Panopticon, notably the panoramic layout of the cameras, intersected with individual monitors that allowed for simultaneous viewing of numerous targets, as well as the ability to focus on an individual. A broader comparison was also made between the annular area of the Panopticon, and the streets of central Harrow, with a target attracting the attention of an operator and, in principle, leaving Harrow town centre, or annular area behind and becoming “detained” in the operators monitor. Other factors, such as twenty four hour lighting were also Panopticol in their nature.

Some of the objectives of the Panopticon were not present within CCTV however. For example, though a suspect may possess no way of knowing if a particular camera monitoring them is manned, they are aware of the direction in which the camera faces, a privilege not extended to the inmates of the Panopticon. The changing direction of the cameras does alter the behaviour of potential suspects however, arguably fulfilling Bentham’s intended purpose of self regulated behaviour. Though in light of the complicated issues involved in crime prevention within Harrow, such as drug addiction, influences upon offenders behaviour with regards to the Panopticon calls for more in depth analysis through later studies.

The comparison between the Panopticon and Harrow’s CCTV system was largely seen to be a valid and relevant one. Though the author was familiar with the philosophy of Jeremy Bentham before the study, an introduction to his Panopticon design was considered particularly interesting.

Sociological consequences of the research topic
As noted above, Harrow’s CCTV department is largely autonomous. This can result in certain procedures being over looked in favour of efficiency. This practice raises questions regarding what guidelines are in place to train and influence operators when making decisions regarding who to target. Through the authors personal reflection it was revealed that there are no official or objective guidelines in place regarding the targeting of offenders, instead operators are encouraged to rely upon a variety of “…extra legal variables”. (Burke, 2005, 145) These variables predominately involve, age, gender, dress sense and race.

It was found that young people often receive a disproportionate amount of attention, especially when congregating in groups or thought to be loitering. When these groups consisted of males dressed in attire not considered respectable, and of those from ethnic minority communities, the likeliness of being monitored multiplied, confirming Quinney’s (1970) hypothesis.

The only example found of overt verbal racism was the labelling of white, working class males who seemed to attract a greater degree of cynical, patronising comments. It could be argued however that the racist attitudes were being invisibly made towards ethnic minorities, as the general consensus was that these white males should somehow know better.
It was found the targeting of particular social groups was generally related to the prevention of crimes associated with that particular group. For example, females were associated with theft from stores, while Asian and Afro-Caribbean males were targeted in relation to preventing robbery. Statistical evidence would suggest this practice was largely justified, though this did raise the issue of self fulfilling prophecies due to the application of labels. Manstead and Hewstone’s (1995) factors which facilitated the occurrence of self fulfilling prophecies were largely seen to be true. Younger targets age, and arguable lack of self concept, triangulates with many examples seen of youths deliberately acting mischievous in front of the cameras, confirming original attitudes directed at them. Examples similar to this were also noted with regards to gangs of males targeted by CCTV.

The study of labelling theory displayed mixed results, with the fulfilment of expected behaviour found to be particularly prevalent to crimes related to social status, and mainly to males.

Sociological environment that facilitates the rise of the research topic

Arguably, throughout history, no other method of social control has been created and implemented so quickly on such a broad social level as CCTV. Early examples of surveillance based correction facilities such as the Panopticon may have been conceived of over three hundred years ago, though its practical applications have largely lain dormant until the past two decades, where technological developments and increased investment have symbolised society’s transition into the risk society.

In light of these factors, it is believed that CCTV symbolises a techno scientific institution created as a result of societies changing attitudes towards the management of risk. CCTV has progressed and reformed from earlier surveillance designs, most notably the Panopticon, and continues to do so as a result of the exchange of information between science and industry. And, as shown throughout this dissertation, this results in “…whole new populations of respectable people being drawn into contact with enforcing authorities and mechanisms of control” (Wells,2007,p.14).

(11c) Personal reflection of the research process

The author feels the theoretical approach taken to the research subject was too broad, encompassing numerous areas that warrant more specific research in relation to CCTV. This approach did however provide the author with opportunities to explore vast interconnecting theories considered relevant to various areas of criminological research, and, overall the research process was felt to be of great success.

This study also provided insight into a social control practice the author has been involved in for six years, allowing an objective look at issues that would have otherwise gone unseen. In light of this, the author hopes to apply much of the findings of the research topic into future involvement within CCTV, as well other professional and academic pursuits.
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS AND FIGURES

List of Abbreviations

BBC  British Broadcasting Corporation
CCTV  Closed Circuit Television
CAD  Computer Aided Dispatch
IC1  Identity Code 1: White
IC2  Identity Code 2: Mediterranean
IC3  Identity Code 3: Afro-Caribbean
IC4  Identity Code 4: Asian (Indian, Pakistani)
IC5  Identity Code 5: East Asian (Chinese, Japanese)
IC6  Identity Code 6: Arabic
RAID  Redundant Array of Inexpensive Disks
Reference List


